Immunization Prevention Survey Results

Spring 2023
Summary & Methodology

In late January 2023, President Biden announced his intention that the COVID-19 Public Health Emergency (PHE) will end on May 11, 2023. The termination of the Public Health Emergency has many implications across the entire healthcare system and raises several questions on whether and how certain provisions will continue to apply. National Alliance, conducted a survey that seeks to better understand employer directions with the end of the public health emergency including:

- Current approaches/strategies
- Upcoming plans for coverage of immunizations, testing, and treatment
- Employee communications
- ACA litigation on preventive care

The survey, including key purchaser expectations, was developed via an iterative process through feedback and insights from coalitions, and others. Survey responses were then collected from April to May 2023 using the online survey platform Qualtrics. Respondents were asked quantitative questions and could also provide qualitative comments on up to three key delighters and dissatisfiers for each provider.

The survey was distributed through National Alliance coalition members from the Greater Philadelphia Business Coalition on Health, the Midwest Business Group on Health, and the Washington Health Alliance. The findings from the survey were shared at a national virtual roundtable where employers who participated in the survey shared their thoughts and discussed the findings. The survey resulted in a convenience sampling of 29 private and public employers from a variety of industries providing coverage for more than 1.5 million people across the country.

General attitudinal statements and importance ratings were evaluated overall using Microsoft Excel to create the data displays found in this report.
Employer Concerns and Strategies:

• While 76% agreed that keeping up-to-date based on current COVID guidelines is core to their immunization strategies going forward, 81% agreed that the pandemic has increased the urgency of focusing on all vaccinations for employees and their families.

• 96% of respondents agreed that employee engagement in primary care was a critical health strategy to improve immunization uptake.

• 81% believe that employers are a trusted source for vaccine information compared to 62% for health plans.

• Most significant contributors impacting employees to not be fully vaccinated – lack of trust in vaccines (71% for COVID and 33% for other immunizations), confusion or misinformation (71% for COVID and 29% for other), and safety and efficacy concerns (57% for COVID and 24% for other).

• With the end of the public health emergency, only 14% are planning to cover over-the-counter tests at 100% and 33% will not cover; going forward, COVID treatment will be covered consistent with similar non-COVID services by 71% and another 24% envision covering at 100%.

• In tracking immunization rates, 79% of employers have vaccine information rates for their workforce on COVID, and 63% have information on influenza vaccinations.

• Given the recent ruling by a federal judge in Texas invalidating much of the Affordable Care Act's coverage of preventive care without cost sharing, 72% expect to continue providing coverage for all preventive services at 100%; 6% expect to be more selective; and 22% did not know how they would approach coverage for preventive care services.
Key Employer Comments:

Coverage after the Public Health Emergency

• “Covering four over the counter tests per month”
• “We moved to normal plan provision for hospitalizations, office visits, etc. but continue to pay for vaccines and tests at 100% for 2023. We will review for 2024.”
• “Effort is to offer some consistency rather than creating confusion”
• “We will cover immunizations at 100% and we cover blood tests at 100% so these will be included”
• “We will cover COVID over-the-counter tests, but limit reimbursable number per month and money per test”

Challenges with Vaccine Uptake

• “COVID vaccinations came quickly without the months of testing and learning as with other vaccines the public is already aware of. Something new, so much information thrown at people during a time of high emotional stress contributed to confusion and individual approach to this topic.”
• “As many individuals got their information from social media, they were quick to reject the COVID vaccine and found religious exemption as a workaround. We had a committee that reviewed every request for medical or religious exemptions. Many had their religious leader sign saying it was against their religion even though the overall religious affiliate was saying that they supported vaccination.”
• “Rapid development and delivery of COVID vaccinations (EUA Status), in addition to political polarization of the pandemic created a lot of skepticism with the vaccine.”
29 Total Respondents

Number of Employees

- 10,000+ employees, 33%
- 5,000-9,999 employees, 21%
- 1,000-4,999 employees, 29%
- 500-999 employees, 13%
- Fewer than 500 employees, 4%
Our company has a target immunization rate for non-COVID vaccinations

Keeping COVID vaccination status up-to-date is core to our immunization strategy

Vaccinations/immunizations (including flu, etc.) are a critical part of my workforce health strategy

Vaccine hesitancy increased during the Public Health Emergency for all vaccines

Rates for our non-COVID vaccinations decreased during the Public Health Emergency

Strongly Agree  Agree  Disagree  Strongly Disagree  Don’t Know
Employer’s Agreement Regarding Immunizations Uptake and Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Don’t Know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Engagement with Primary Care is critical to our health strategy including to improve immunization uptake</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The pandemic increased the urgency of focusing on all vaccinations for our employees and their families</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fragmented healthcare delivery makes it difficult to track and trend vaccination rates</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers are a trusted source on vaccination information for employees and their families</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health plans are a trusted source on vaccination information for employees and their families</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Coverage after the Public Health Emergency

**COVID Immunizations**
- Covered at 100%: 81%
- Not Covered: 5%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 14%

**COVID Over the Counter Tests**
- Covered at 100%: 29%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 29%
- Covered with special limitations: 10%
- Not Covered: 33%
- Don’t Know: 14%

**COVID PCR Lab Test**
- Covered at 100%: 62%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 29%
- Don’t Know: 10%

**COVID Treatment**
- Covered at 100%: 71%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 24%
- Don’t Know: 5%

**COVID Immunizations**
- Covered at 100%: 81%
- Not Covered: 5%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 14%

**COVID Over the Counter Tests**
- Covered at 100%: 29%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 29%
- Covered with special limitations: 10%
- Not Covered: 33%
- Don’t Know: 14%

**COVID PCR Lab Test**
- Covered at 100%: 62%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 29%
- Don’t Know: 10%

**COVID Treatment**
- Covered at 100%: 71%
- Covered consistent with similar non-COVID services: 24%
- Don’t Know: 5%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>COVID Vaccination</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Non-COVID Vaccination</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of trust in vaccines</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confusion or misinformation</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and efficacy concerns</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preference for natural immunity</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural reasons</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apathy, lack of personal prioritization</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious reasons</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical reasons</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of access or convenience</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of transportation</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-of-pocket cost of immunizations</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Significant Issue**
- **Minor Issue**
- **Not an Issue**
## Employer Practices During the Public Health Emergency – COVID and Non-COVID

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>COVID</th>
<th>Non-COVID</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Offer benefit design or other incentives for immunization</td>
<td>57% Yes, 38% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
<td>43% Yes, 52% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reimburse for or provide transportation to vaccine appointments</td>
<td>5% Yes, 86% No, 10% Don't Know</td>
<td>10% Yes, 86% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase vaccines on behalf of my population</td>
<td>24% Yes, 71% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
<td>24% Yes, 71% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand on-site vaccination event access to include nontraditional shifts and/or covered (eligible) dependents</td>
<td>52% Yes, 43% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
<td>29% Yes, 62% No, 10% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule on-site vaccination events</td>
<td>62% Yes, 33% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
<td>43% Yes, 48% No, 10% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide time off for vaccine appointment and recovery</td>
<td>81% Yes, 19% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
<td>33% Yes, 62% No, 5% Don't Know</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Employer Practices After the Public Health Emergency – COVID and Non-COVID

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>COVID</th>
<th>Non-COVID</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Offer benefit design or other incentives for immunization</td>
<td>43% 5% 48% 5%</td>
<td>45% 5% 45% 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reimburse for or provide transportation to vaccine appointments</td>
<td>5% 86% 5%</td>
<td>5% 85% 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase vaccines on behalf of my population</td>
<td>19% 5% 71% 5%</td>
<td>25% 5% 60% 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand on-site vaccination event access to include nontraditional shifts and/or covered (eligible) dependents</td>
<td>19% 10% 57% 14%</td>
<td>25% 20% 40% 15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule on-site vaccination events</td>
<td>38% 52% 10%</td>
<td>55% 10% 30% 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide time off for vaccine appointment and recovery</td>
<td>33% 14% 43% 10%</td>
<td>30% 15% 45% 10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Yes, No, Considering, No, Not Considering, Don't Know
Information on rates of vaccination in the workforce

Key Employer Comments:

- “Difficult to get this information from providers”
- “We have data from carrier, but it is not reliable for all vaccines listed”
Vaccination Rates for Covered Population

- **Across Total Population**: 55% Yes, 25% No, Considering, 10% No, Not Considering, 10% Don't Know
- **By Gender**: 35% Yes, 30% No, Considering, 20% No, Not Considering, 15% Don't Know
- **By Age**: 30% Yes, 35% No, Considering, 20% No, Not Considering, 15% Don't Know
- **By ZIP Code**: 21% Yes, 42% No, Considering, 21% No, Not Considering, 16% Don't Know
- **By Worksite/Location**: 20% Yes, 45% No, Considering, 20% No, Not Considering, 15% Don't Know
- **By Comorbidity (diabetes, obesity, etc.)**: 11% Yes, 47% No, Considering, 26% No, Not Considering, 16% Don't Know
- **By Race and Ethnicity**: 10% Yes, 50% No, Considering, 25% No, Not Considering, 15% Don't Know
## Immunization Communication Strategy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>During Public Health Emergency</th>
<th>After Public Health Emergency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benefits and safety of immunizations</td>
<td>90% (5%)</td>
<td>80% (15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education on immunization coverage including eligible settings</td>
<td>80% (15%)</td>
<td>65% (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace policies related to immunization</td>
<td>70% (25%)</td>
<td>40% (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives to complete immunization series including boosters</td>
<td>35% (60%)</td>
<td>15% (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives for primary care visits</td>
<td>45% (45%)</td>
<td>35% (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education on childhood immunizations</td>
<td>45% (45%)</td>
<td>45% (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tailored communications to address specific populations with high levels of vaccination disparities and/or hesitancy</td>
<td>40% (55%)</td>
<td>30% (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tailored communications to high-risk populations</td>
<td>35% (60%)</td>
<td>25% (45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work with trusted community organizations to promote the importance of preventive care screenings, exams, and vaccinations</td>
<td>40% (50%)</td>
<td>25% (35%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: Yes, No, Don’t Know
Strategies Expected from Health Plan and/or Vendors

- Monitor disparities in care
  - COVID Vaccines: 50%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 63%

- Commit to meet target immunization rates
  - COVID Vaccines: 44%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 38%

- General communication for employees and families to stay up to date on immunizations
  - COVID Vaccines: 100%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 100%

- Target outreach to members with gaps in immunizations
  - COVID Vaccines: 50%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 63%

- Target outreach to those who are at high risk for severe illness
  - COVID Vaccines: 75%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 88%

- Communicate/educate members about coverage changes resulting from the end of the Public Health Emergency
  - COVID Vaccines: 75%
  - Non-COVID Vaccines: 100%
With Regard to the Recent Texas Ruling Modifying the ACA Preventive Services Mandate

72% We expect to continue providing coverage for all preventive services at 100%

22% Don't know

6% We expect to selectively review which preventive services would continue at 100% coverage if not mandated by law