

Comment Adjudication Quick Reference Guide

All comments submitted during the ballot period must be adjudicated.

The DPM must track *all changes resulting from comment adjudication on the clean MS Word draft.*

The DPM must record evidence of the final disposition toward resolution of each comment, with the rationale or explanation for the adjudication, on the MS Excel Ballot Comments spreadsheet.

The DPM is not required to incorporate or resolve any comments submitted with affirmative or abstaining votes but shall note their adjudication of the ballot comments with a clear rationale statement on the MS Excel Ballot Comments spreadsheet. The DPM is not required to document lengthy back-and-forth discussions with commenters. The DPM's response in the MS Excel Ballot Comments spreadsheet should simply reflect the final adjudication of the comment as **accepted** or the DPM's **rationale for non-acceptance**. The DPM may send one email to all Observer, nonmember, affirmative, and abstaining commenters and attach the annotated MS Excel Ballot Comments spreadsheet.

Options to Adjudicate Negative Votes (SCOM ¶ 6.3.5.2)

- **Persuasive** - If the DPM (and the drafting members) determine the content of the negative vote is technically valid and within the scope of the draft standard, then the comment shall be considered persuasive and the suggested change (as agreed between the DPM and the commenter) is incorporated into the draft.
- **Not Persuasive** - If the DPM and the drafting members determine the comment is not persuasive (i.e., the suggested change and the rationale for requesting the change do not render the document more technically accurate or valid than the original text), the recommendation shall be presented to the SC for final adjudication.

This must be done by one of the following means:

- Inclusion of the proposed Not Persuasive recommendation and supporting rationale in a subsequent reballot
 - Distribution of a 14-Day Ballot to the SC
 - Review during an SC meeting with adjudication by voice vote. Disposition of the comment shall be recorded in the minutes.
 - If the SC **affirms** the Not Persuasive recommendation, the negative vote is ruled Not Persuasive, and the requested change is not incorporated into the draft
-
- **Not Related/Non-Responsive** - If the DPM and the drafting members determine the negative vote addresses technical requirements that fall outside of the scope of the draft document or relate to material that was not part of the ballot, the ballot is ruled Not Related and the requested change is not incorporated into the draft.
 - A negative that does not meet the requirements of SCOM ¶ 6.3.2.4 shall be ruled Non-Responsive
 - **Previously Considered** - If the DPM and the drafting members determine the subject of the negative vote was considered during previous rounds of balloting and ruled either Not Persuasive or Not Related, then the DPM so notes and the requested change is not incorporated into the draft.
 - **Withdrawn or Withdrawn with Editorial Changes** - If, after discussing their negative ballot with the DPM, the voting member determines their negative vote is no longer valid or may be resolved by making an editorial change, they may withdraw their negative vote and must notify both the DPM and Staff Liaison in writing of the change of their vote to either affirmative or abstain. Negative withdrawals are included as referenced items in subsequent ballots.

The DPM shall notify the individual voting member of the resolution of their comments submitted with a negative vote by email with a clear rationale statement and note on the MS Excel Ballot Comments spreadsheet.