

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
COURT OF CLAIMS

---

M.L. CHARTIER EXCAVATING, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v

MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF  
TREASURY,

Defendant.

---

Court of Claims No. 18-000081-MT

Honorable Colleen A. O'Brien

Michael J. Leavitt (P45336)  
George L. Howell (P74468)  
Sullivan & Leavitt, PC  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
M.L. Chartier Excavating, Inc.  
P.O. Box 5490  
Northville, MI 48167  
(248) 349-3980 ext 211  
ML@Sullivanleavitt.com  
glh@sullivanleavitt.com

Scott L. Damich (P74126)  
Emily C. Zillgitt (P73792)  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Michigan Dep't of Attorney General  
Attorneys for Defendant  
Revenue and Tax Division  
P.O. Box 30754  
Lansing, MI 48909  
(517) 335-7584  
DamichS@michigan.gov  
ZillgittE@michigan.gov

---

FINAL JUDGMENT

At a session of said of Court held in the City  
of Troy, County of Oakland, State  
of Michigan on February 28, 2020.

Present: HON. Colleen A. O'Brien  
Colleen A. O'Brien, Court of Claims Judge

This matter having come before the Court for entry of a Final Judgment conforming to the Opinion and Order of the Court dated February 12, 2020, and the Court being duly advised in the premises:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff was not entitled to claim the rolling stock exemption for the tax years in issue, and judgment is granted in favor of Defendant Michigan Department of Treasury. Final Assessment UW85894 is affirmed in the amount of \$150,078 in use tax, \$0 in penalty, and interest of \$25,043.74 through February 29, 2020. Statutory interest continues to accrue pursuant to the Revenue Act.


This Final Judgment resolves the last pending claim and closes the case.



---


HON. COLLEEN A. O'BRIEN  
Court of Claims Judge

Approved as to Form:



---

Michael J. Leavitt (P45336)  
Attorney for Plaintiff



---

Scott L. Damich (P74126)  
Assistant Attorney General for Defendant

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
COURT OF CLAIMS

---

M.L. CHARTIER EXCAVATING, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v

MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF  
TREASURY,

Defendant.

---

Court of Claims No. 18-000081-MT

Honorable Colleen A. O'Brien

Michael J. Leavitt (P45336)  
George L. Howell (P74468)  
Sullivan & Leavitt, PC  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
M.L. Chartier Excavating, Inc.  
P.O. Box 5490  
Northville, MI 48167  
(248) 349-3980 ext 211  
ML@Sullivanleavitt.com  
glh@sullivanleavitt.com

Scott L. Damich (P74126)  
Emily C. Zillgitt (P73792)  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Michigan Dep't of Attorney General  
Attorneys for Defendant  
Revenue and Tax Division  
P.O. Box 30754  
Lansing, MI 48909  
(517) 335-7584  
DamichS@michigan.gov  
ZillgittE@michigan.gov

---

FINAL JUDGMENT

At a session of said of Court held in the City  
of \_\_\_\_\_, County of \_\_\_\_\_, State  
of Michigan on \_\_\_\_\_, 2020.

Present: HON. \_\_\_\_\_  
Colleen A. O'Brien, Court of Claims Judge

This matter having come before the Court for entry of a Final Judgment conforming to the Opinion and Order of the Court dated February 12, 2020, and the Court being duly advised in the premises:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff was not entitled to claim the rolling stock exemption for the tax years in issue, and judgment is granted in favor of Defendant Michigan Department of Treasury. Final Assessment UW85894 is affirmed in the amount of \$150,078 in use tax, \$0 in penalty, and interest of \$25,043.74 through February 29, 2020. Statutory interest continues to accrue pursuant to the Revenue Act.

This Final Judgment resolves the last pending claim and closes the case.

---

HON. COLLEEN A. O'BRIEN  
Court of Claims Judge

Approved as to Form:



---

Michael J. Leavitt (P45336)  
Attorney for Plaintiff

---

Scott L. Damich (P74126)  
Assistant Attorney General for Defendant